

## PS 948: Political Inequality: Measures, Causes, Effects and Remedies

Department of Political Science  
University of Wisconsin–Madison  
Spring 2018

Class time: Mondays, 1:20-3:15pm in 422 North Hall (The Ogg Room)  
Instructor: Rikhil R. Bhavnani  
Course site: <https://canvas.wisc.edu/courses/86570>  
Office hours: Thursdays, 3-4pm in 312 North Hall. To ensure that I can see everyone, please sign up in advance at <https://calendar.wisc.edu/scheduling-assistant/public/profiles/DxXsyvez.html>.  
Email: [bhavnani@wisc.edu](mailto:bhavnani@wisc.edu)

**Course overview:** Political equality is a normative ideal, and is thought to have positive consequences on citizens' socio-economic outcomes such as income, health and education. As a result, many societies have sought to correct political inequality through various remedies, including electoral quotas. In this course, we will review what political inequality is, and examine how scholars have measured it, and studied its causes, effects and remedies. Our selective examination of the literature will focus on the cutting edge of the empirical literature on inequalities in political participation and representation, and will pay close attention to issues of measurement and causal inference.

**Learning outcomes:** Successful students will be able to develop theoretically grounded and testable hypotheses about the causes and effects of, and remedies for, inequalities in political representation and participation. They will be able to formulate and implement clear research designs for evaluating their hypotheses.

**Course credits:** This is a three credit class. The credit standard for this course is met by an expectation of a total of 135 hours of student engagement with the course learning activities, which include class meetings of two hours each week, multiple instructor-student meetings over the course of the semester, reading, data collection, analysis, writing, etc.

**Assignments and grading:** The class grade will be based on:

- Active, informed class participation, for 15% of the class grade. Participants are expected to have read the assigned works closely, and reflected on them, including possibly by discussing them with their colleagues before class.
- Two in-class presentations, for 15% of the class grade each. PDFs of the presentations should be uploaded to Canvas before class. A sign-up sheet for presentations will be circulated in the first class.
- A referee report, for 15% of the class grade. These may be written on one of the starred readings, and should be posted on Canvas by 8pm the day before the reading is discussed. See [are.berkeley.edu/courses/ARE251/2004/assignments/RRGuidelines.pdf](http://are.berkeley.edu/courses/ARE251/2004/assignments/RRGuidelines.pdf) for advice on how to write a referee report, and <http://chrisblattman.com/2012/01/18/how-to-referee->

[an-academic-paper/](#) for further leads.

- A 25-page research paper and its presentation, for 40% of the class grade. Students should discuss their topics with me once by week 6, and a second time by week 11. Papers are due on Canvas one week after the last class, on 5/7. The paper will be graded on the questions posed, theory and hypotheses developed and the research design, and not the statistical significance of preliminary results.

**Disabilities:** Students needing special accommodations to enable full participation in this course should contact me during the first week of class. All information will remain confidential. You may, in addition to contacting me, contact the McBurney Disability Resource Center ([www.mcburney.wisc.edu](http://www.mcburney.wisc.edu)) at 1305 Linden Drive and 608.263.2741 regarding questions about campus policies and services.

A detailed class plan, subject to revision, follows.

### **Week 1 (1/29): What is political inequality? Do we need it? Why?**

Verba, Sidney. "Thoughts About Political Equality: What Is It? Why Do We Want It?" Harvard University.

Dahl, Robert A. 2006. *On Political Equality*. New Haven, London: Yale University Press.

Pitkin, Hanna Fenichel. 1967. *The Concept of Representation*. Berkeley: University of California

Urbinate, Nadia, and Mark E. Warren. 2008. "The Concept of Representation in Contemporary Democratic Theory." *Annual Review of Political Science* 11:387-412.

Casellas, J.P. and Wallace, S.J., 2015. "The Role of Race, Ethnicity, and Party on Attitudes Toward Descriptive Representation." *American Politics Research* 43(1): 144-169.

### **Week 2 (2/5): Measures**

Golder, Matt, and Jacek Stramski. 2010. "Ideological Congruence and Electoral Institutions: Conceptualization and Measurement." *American Journal of Political Science*, January.

Butler, Daniel M., and David E. Brookman. 2011. "Do Politicians Racially Discriminate Against Constituents? A Field Experiment on State Legislators." *American Journal of Political Science* 55 (3):463-77.

Samuels, David, and Richard Snyder. 2001. "The Value of a Vote: Malapportionment in Comparative Perspective." *British Journal of Political Science* 31:651-71.

Lupu, Noam, Lucía Selios, and Zach Warner. 2017. "A New Measure of Congruence: The Earth Mover's Distance." *Political Analysis* 25 (1):95-113.

Caughey, Devin, and Christopher Warshaw. 2017. "Policy Preferences and Policy Change: Dynamic Responsiveness in the American States, 1936–2014." *American Political Science Review*: 1-18.

### **Week 3 (2/12): Causes—Economic inequality**

Bartels, Larry M. 2008. "Unequal Democracy: The Political Economy of the New Gilded Age." Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press.

Brunner, Eric, Stephen L. Ross, and Ebonya Washington. 2013. "Does Less Income Mean Less Representation?" *American Economic Journal: Economic Policy* 5 (2):53-76.

Carnes, Nicholas, and Noam Lupu. "Rethinking the Comparative Perspective on Class and Representation: Evidence from Latin America." *American Journal of Political Science* 59(1): 1-18.

Kasara, Kimuli, and Pavithra Suryanarayan. 2015. "When do the rich vote less than the poor and why? Explaining turnout inequality across the world." *American Journal of Political Science* 59(3): 613-627.

Dal Bó, Ernesto, Frederico Finan, Olle Folke, Torsten Persson, and Johanna Rickne. 2017. "Who Becomes a Politician?" *The Quarterly Journal of Economics* 132 (4):1877-1914.

#### **Week 4 (2/19): Causes—Dynasties**

Cruz, Cesi, Julien Labonne, and Pablo Querubin. 2017. "Politician family networks and electoral outcomes: Evidence from the philippines." *American Economic Review* 107 (10):3006-37.

Chandra, Kanchan. 2016. *Democratic Dynasties: State, Party and Family in Contemporary Indian Politics*: Cambridge University Press. Selections.

Smith, Daniel M. 2018. *Dynasties and Democracy: The Inherited Incumbency Advantage in Japan*: Stanford University Press. Selections.

Fiva, Jon H, and Daniel M Smith. 2018. "Political Dynasties and the Incumbency Advantage in Party-Centered Environments." *American Political Science Review*.

\* Querubin, Pablo. 2012. "Political reform and elite persistence: Term limits and political dynasties in the Philippines."

#### **Week 5 (2/26): Causes—Voter Discrimination**

Stephens-Davidowitz, Seth. 2014. "The cost of racial animus on a black candidate: Evidence using Google search data." *Journal of Public Economics* 118: 26-40.

Folke, Olle, and Johanna Rickne. 2016. "The Glass Ceiling in Politics: Formalization and Empirical Tests." *Comparative Political Studies* 49 (5):567-99.

Sen, Maya, and Omar Wasow. 2016. "Race as a bundle of sticks: Designs that estimate effects of seemingly immutable characteristics." *Annual Review of Political Science* 19:499-522.

\* Broockman, David E, and Evan J Soltas. 2017. "A Natural Experiment on Taste-Based Racial and Ethnic Discrimination in Elections."

\* Teele, Dawn, Joshua L Kalla, and Frances McCall Rosenbluth. 2017. "Faces of Bias in Politics: Evidence from Elite and Voter Conjoint Experiments on Gender."

#### **Week 6 (3/5): Effects—Democratization**

Miller, Grant. 2008. "Women's Suffrage, Political Responsiveness, and Child Survival in American History." *Quarterly Journal of Economics* 123 (3):1287-327.

Kudamatsu, Masayuki. 2012. "Has Democratization Reduced Infant Mortality in Sub-Saharan Africa? Evidence from Micro Data." *Journal of the European Economic Association* 10(6): 1294-1317.

Fujiwara, Thomas. "Voting Technology, Political Responsiveness, and Infant Health: Evidence from Brazil." *Econometrica* 83.2 (2015): 423-464.

Acharya, Avidit, Matthew Blackwell, and Maya Sen. 2015. "A culture of disenfranchisement: How American slavery continues to affect voting behavior." *The Journal of Politics*, forthcoming.

Braconnier, Céline, Jean-Yves Dormagen, and Vincent Pons. 2017. "Voter registration costs and disenfranchisement: experimental evidence from France." *American Political Science Review*:1-21.

### **Week 7 (3/12): Effects—The Value of a Vote**

Ardanaz, Martin, and Carlos Scartascini. 2013. "Inequality and Personal Income Taxation: The Origins and Effects of Legislative Malapportionment." *Comparative Political Studies*.

\* Bhavnani, Rikhil R. 2016. "The Effects of Malapportionment on Economic Development: Evidence from India's 2008 Redistricting."

Ansolabehere, Stephen, Alan Gerber, and James Snyder. 2002. "Equal Votes, Equal Money: Court-Ordered Redistricting and Public Expenditures in the American States." *American Political Science Review* 96 (4):767-77.

Elis, Roy, Neil Malhotra, and Marc Meredith. 2009. "Apportionment Cycles as Natural Experiments." *Political Analysis* 17 (4):358-76.

Galiani, Sebastian, Iván Torre, and Gustavo Torrens. 2016. "Fiscal Federalism and Legislative Malapportionment: Causal Evidence from Independent but Related Natural Experiments." *Economics & Politics* 28 (1):133-59.

### **Week 8 (3/19): Effects—Descriptive representation**

Irma, Clots-Figueras. 2011. "Women in Politics: Evidence from the Indian States." *Journal of Public Economics* 95 (7-8):664-90.

Clots-Figueras, Irma. 2012. "Are Female Leaders Good for Education? Evidence from India." *American Economic Journal: Applied Economics* (January).

Ferreira, Fernando, and Joseph Gyourko. 2014. "Does gender matter for political leadership? The case of US mayors." *Journal of Public Economics*, 112, pp.24-39.

Broockman, David E. 2013. "Black politicians are more intrinsically motivated to advance Blacks' interests: A field experiment manipulating political incentives." *American Journal of Political Science* 57 (3):521-36.

Chattopadhyay, Raghavendra, and Esther Duflo. 2004. "Women as Policy Makers: Evidence from a Randomized Policy Experiment in India." *Econometrica* 72 (5):36.

### **Week 9 (4/2): Remedies—Altering participation**

Da Silveira, Bernardo S, and João MP De Mello. 2011. "Campaign advertising and election outcomes: Quasi-natural experiment evidence from gubernatorial elections in Brazil." *The Review of Economic Studies* 78 (2):590-612.

\* Avis, Eric, Claudio Ferraz, Frederico Finan, and Carlos Varjão. 2017. "Money and Politics: The Effects of Campaign Spending Limits on Political Competition and Incumbency Advantage." National Bureau of Economic Research.

Fowler, Anthony. 2013. "Electoral and Policy Consequences of Voter Turnout: Evidence from Compulsory Voting in Australia." *Quarterly Journal of Political Science* 8 (2):159-82.

Cepaluni, Gabriel, and F Daniel Hidalgo. 2016. "Compulsory voting can increase political inequality: Evidence from Brazil." *Political Analysis* 24 (2):273-80.

Neggers, Yusuf. 2018. "Enfranchising Your Own? Experimental Evidence on Bureaucrat Diversity and Election Bias in India." *American Economic Review*.

#### **Week 10 (4/9): Remedies—Information**

Dunning, Thad, Guy Grossman, Macartan Humphreys, Susan D. Hyde, and Craig McIntosh, eds. 2018. *Metaketa I: The Limits of Electoral Accountability*. Chapters 1, 2, 3, 11, 13.

Ferraz, Claudio, and Frederico Finan. 2008. "Exposing corrupt politicians: the effects of Brazil's publicly released audits on electoral outcomes." *The Quarterly Journal of Economics* 123 (2):703-45.

Banerjee, Abhijit, Selvan Kumar, Rohini Pande, and Felix Su. 2011. "Do informed voters make better choices? Experimental evidence from urban India." *Unpublished manuscript*.

\* Querubin, Pablo, Eric Arias, Horacio Larreguy, and John Marshall. 2018. "Does the Content and Mode of Delivery of Information Matter for Political Accountability? Evidence from a Field Experiment in Mexico."

Butler, Daniel M, and David W Nickerson. 2011. "Can learning constituency opinion affect how legislators vote? Results from a field experiment." *Quarterly Journal of Political Science* 6 (1):55-83.

#### **Week 11 (4/16): Remedies—Electoral quotas**

Pande, Rohini. 2003. "Can Mandated Political Representation Increase Policy Influence for Disadvantaged Minorities? Theory and Evidence from India." *American Economic Review* 93 (4):1132-51.

Dunning, Thad, and Janhavi Nilekani. 2013. "Ethnic Quotas and Political Mobilization: Caste, Parties, and Distribution in Indian Village Councils." *American Political Science Review* 107 (01):35-56.

Bhavnani, Rikhil R. 2017. "Do the Effects of Temporary Ethnic Group Quotas Persist? Evidence from India." *American Economic Journal: Applied Economics* 9 (3):105-23.

\* O'Connell, Stephen. 2017. "Can quotas increase the supply of candidates for higher-level positions? Evidence from local government in India." Mimeo.

Besley, Timothy, Olle Folke, Torsten Persson, and Johanna Rickne. 2017. "Gender quotas and the crisis of the mediocre man: Theory and evidence from Sweden." *American Economic Review* 107 (8):2204-42.

#### **Week 12 (4/23): Class presentations**

#### **Week 13 (4/30): Class presentations**

**Final papers due on Canvas, 5/7**